AN APPROACH TO ADAPTIVE REUSE OF RELIGIOUS AND EDUCATIONAL BUILDINGS

Planning Department
Village of Mamaroneck
Bob Galvin, AICP - Village Planner
Greg Cutler - Assistant Planner
AGENDA

▪ Why should we promote adaptive reuse?
▪ Selected examples of adaptive reuses.
▪ “What not to do” - A case study in the Village of Mamaroneck.
▪ Solutions - Zoning for Adaptive Reuse
▪ Eligible buildings & split zones
▪ Most Holy Trinity Example
▪ Where are we now?
▪ Q & A
WHY SHOULD WE PROMOTE ADAPTIVE REUSE, WHY RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS?

- **Adaptive reuse**, or re-use, is the process of repurposing buildings—old buildings that have outlived their original purposes—for different uses or functions while retaining their historic features.

- Gained Traction in the 1970’s and 1980’s w/increased focus on historic preservation

- Primarily Public Buildings, Train Stations, Factories
  - Public Purposes such as libraries, civic use, condominiums, restaurants, museums, entertainment, cultural uses

- Recent Examples in Mamaroneck
  - **Mamaroneck Train Station** – extensive adaptive ruse w/Preservation Architect (Restaurant on ground floor, offices on 2nd Floor) - 2012 WMPF Award
  - **Old Hook & Ladder Firehouse** on Mamaroneck Ave – discussions with LMCTV for new studios
WHY SHOULD WE PROMOTE ADAPTIVE REUSE, WHY RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS?

- **“Architecture is Memory”**
  - Churches and Schools have an emotional bond to families in the community (religious services, baptisms, weddings, funerals, education, relationships to fellow parishioners)
  - Familiar structures connecting to neighborhoods

- **Historical and Architectural Significance**
  - **St. Thomas** – listed on the National Register
    - Oldest congregation in Mamaroneck - established in 1814
    - Church/Parish Hall built in 1886
    - Heathcote Hall – 1925 – Endowment Building - 1887
  - **Mamaroneck United Methodist Gothic Church** - Listed on National Register
    - established in 1812
    - Church – 1859
  - **Most Holy Trinity**
    - Church/Rectory – 1886
    - School – 1928
    - Convent - 1914
WHY SHOULD WE PROMOTE ADAPTIVE REUSE, WHY RELIGIOUS BUILDINGS? – NEW DEVELOPMENTS

  - Largest restructuring of the Catholic Archdiocese in 200 Years
  - Closed/Merged 1/3 of the 368 Parishes
  - Westchester County – 12 Parishes (Churches/Schools) closed
  - Seven Schools Closed in Scarsdale, Valhalla, West Harrison, Yonkers
  - Four Schools in Yonkers being reused by Yonkers Public Schools
  - Remaining Schools reused for private/public special needs children

- Village of Mamaroneck – merger between St. Vito’s and Most Holy Trinity (MHT)
  - New Parish is St. Vito’s and MHT w/buildings closed at MHT
  - MHT has had school and convent vacant for over 10 years

- Strait Gate Church in Mamaroneck went into bankruptcy and closed (see case study)
SELECTED EXAMPLES OF ADAPTIVE REUSE

Westchester County

1715 E. Main Street, Yorktown- Chapel turned into winery.

The Purpl, Hastings- Church turned into Music Venue/Co-Working Space.
ARCH 22 – SLEEPY HOLLOW

- Site Details
  - 22 Depeyster Street
  - Former Chapel/Parish Hall Adjacent to Immaculate Conception
  - Built in 1990
  - Architecturally Interesting Stone Building
  - R-5 Zoning District – Multiple Residence
  - Site – 5,227 Square feet
  - 1 Block from Patriot Park and North Broadway
  - Located in single and two family area
  - Under-utilized Property - acquired from Immaculate Conception in 2000
  - Non-Profit Community Group Developed Property for Affordable Housing
  - With Technical Assistance of Housing Action Council – developed 5 affordable condominium units
  - Parking – 10 spaces (2 per unit)
WINERY AT ST. GEORGE – MOHEGAN LAKE/YORKTOWN

- **Site Details**
  - 1715 E. Main Street
  - Long History – associated w/Rev. John LaFarge (stained glass windows)
  - Stone Norman-Style Chapel – Built in 1911 and Chapel of St. John the Evangelist
  - St. John closed in 1918 and became part of St. Patrick’s in Yorktown
  - St. Elizabeth Ann Seton formed in 1963 and became owner of Chapel
  - Closed in 1983 and remained vacant until early 2000’s
  - Site is in residential zone w/wetland buffer - Attempts to develop it as a restaurant
  - Current Owner bought it in 2005
  - After 9 years and significant litigation, site received following approvals:
    - Town Board, rezoning from Residential to Transitional, wetland permit, land swap
    - Planning Board – site plan
    - ZBA – special permit
THE PURPL – HASTINGS-ON-HUDSON

- Site Details
  - Formerly St. Stanislaus Kostka RC Church 1912 - 2005
  - Building acquired by the NY Archdiocese from Baptist Church originally built in late 1800’s
  - Church merged into St. Matthews in Hastings in 2005
  - Building located at 52 Main Street in the downtown of Hastings-on-Hudson
  - Zoning is CC – Central Commercial
  - Building (wood structure) first floor – 2,000 square feet; basement 1,500 square feet
  - Sold by the NY Archdiocese in 2014 to a non-profit The Purple Crayon Learning Center
  - Church turned into a Music Venue/Co-Working Space – rebranded as The Purpl in 2015
SELECTED EXAMPLES OF ADAPTIVE REUSE

New York City

99 Clinton Street, a church-turned-condo in Brooklyn Heights

The Arches at Cobble Hill formerly St. Peter’s Church—also condo
SELECTED EXAMPLES OF ADAPTIVE REUSE

New York City

656 6th Avenue, Church turned nightclub (Limelight), turned into retail space, turned into gym

St. Ann’s Church turned into NYU dormitory- maintained facade
120 MADISON- AQUA TOTS
“WHAT NOT TO DO” (FORMER STRAIT GATE CHURCH)

1st Board
Zoning Petition C-1 & R-4F -> C-1
May 27th, 2015

2nd Board
BOT request Planning Board undertake SEQRA & make recommendation

3rd Board
PB Review Site Plan, Map Change & SEQRA
Starting June 24th, 2015

4th Board
Negative Declaration by PB & positive recommendation to BOT
September 30th, 2015

5th Board
HCZMC Positive Consistency Determination on Project

HCZMC Advisory Consistency Determination on Map Change 11/18

HCZMC Informal Discussion project consistency with LWRP 10/21

Planning Board Approves Resolution
February 24th, 2016

Zoning Board of Appeals Public Hearing on Special Permit for Swim School

Board of Architectural Review

12 Month Process

BOT Approved Map Change
November 23, 2015

HCZMC Positive Consistency Determination on Project

HCZMC Advisory Consistency Determination on Map Change 11/18

HCZMC Informal Discussion project consistency with LWRP 10/21

Planning Board Approves Resolution
February 24th, 2016
AQUA TOTS- AFTER
SOLUTIONS- ZONING FOR ADAPTIVE REUSE

- Purpose – provide for a flexible and streamlined land use review to:
  - Encourage the adaptive reuse of religious and educational buildings
  - Preserve their historical and architectural significance
  - Prevent such buildings from becoming vacant, under-utilized or deteriorated.

- Provides Special Permit by Planning Board for Adaptive Reuse of Eligible Buildings
  - Allows for reuse within existing footprint
  - Allows for PB modification of specified dimensional standards
  - Allows for modification of off-street parking requirements
  - Off-street Parking may also be provided on private lots within 500 feet of the building
  - Compliance with site plan review
  - PB Special Permit is in lieu of any ZBA special permit authority related to private schools and places of worship and religious instruction, including parish houses in residential zones.

- Eligible Buildings
  - Any building originally constructed for religious or educational purposes including buildings previously occupied as a primary or secondary school, place of worship, accessory building to a place of worship (such as a rectory, convent, school gym or similar use) on properties less than 5 acres in size.
SOLUTIONS- ZONING FOR ADAPTIVE REUSE

▪ Conditions of Special Permit
  ▪ **Exterior Alterations**: generally consistent or sympathetic to the original structure's architecture and the neighborhood in which it is located.
  ▪ **Additional Conditions**: Special Permit conditions may be imposed as may be necessary to protect the surrounding neighborhood and to encourage the most appropriate adaptive reuse of the buildings and property.

▪ Split Zoned Properties
  ▪ **For Eligible Buildings** on a lot split between residential and commercial zones, Planning Board may permit an adaptive reuse for any use permitted in either of the applicable zoning districts.

▪ Single and 2-Family Zones
  ▪ **For Eligible Buildings** - only uses permitted in such zone shall be allowed
  ▪ Need to be located on or with direct access to an arterial or collector road
  ▪ Planning Board may permit multi-family housing for senior citizens 62 years of age or older subject to the open space (300 sf per unit) and maximum FAR requirements (0.80 FAR) in the RM-2 District.

▪ Other Applicable Multi-Family and Commercial Zones
  ▪ Adaptive Reuse of Eligible Buildings allowed as a Permitted Use
  ▪ Only uses permitted in such zone shall be allowed
  ▪ Applicants can take advantage of the provisions, flexibility and streamlined review provided by the special permit process
ELIGIBLE BUILDINGS & SPLIT ZONES - VILLAGE OF MAMARONECK

1. St John's Lutheran Church
   122 Fenimore Road
   R-7.5

2. First Church Christ Scientist
   155 Fenimore Rd
   RM-2

3. Westchester Jewish Center
   175 Rockland Ave
   R-29

4. St Thomas Church
   126 Mt Pleasant Ave
   R-5 and C-1

5. (Former) Strait Gate Church
   120 Madison St
   C-1

6. Second Baptist Church/Mamk (Victory Temple Pentecostal)
   727 Old White Plains Rd
   RM-3

7. Church Of St Vitx
   153 New St
   R-2F

8. Mamaroneck Seventh-Day Adventist Church
   181 Prospect Ave
   R-5

9. First Church of Christ (Christian Science Reading Room)
   142-44 Mamaroneck Ave
   C-2

10. Holy Trinity Church
    325 E Boston Post Rd
    R-5 and C-1

11. Methodist Episcopal Church
    514-546 E Boston Post Rd
    R-5 and C-1

12. Trinity Independent Assembly of God
    421 Want Ave
    C-2

13. First Baptist Church
    817 How ard Ave
    R-2F

14. A.M.E. Zion Church
    645 N Barry Ave
    C-1

Sources: Westchester County GIS, Village of Mamaroneck Planning Department, Town of Mamaroneck & Town of Rye Assessment Data

Religious Institutions
MOST HOLY TRINITY - MAMARONECK CASE STUDY
MOST HOLY TRINITY CASE STUDY (CONT.)

- Project Specifics
  - Site Size – 55,082 square feet
  - Not on National Register
  - Split Zoned Property on Boston Post Road
    - C-1 – 80 feet depth into the property
    - Remainder is R-5
  - School divided in half by C-1 and R-5
  - Church and Rectory are in C-1
  - Convent and Gym are in R-5
  - All Interior Work
  - Buildings
    - School – 24,795 sf
    - Gym – 7,440 sf
    - Rectory – 5,060 sf
    - Convent - 4,704 sf
MOST HOLY TRINITY CASE STUDY (CONT.)

- **Project Specifics – FASNY Proposal**
  - Buildings are all vacant
  - School, Gym and Convent have been vacant for 10+ years
  - School closed in 1980’s and then occupied by BOCES and nursery school at rear part
  - Long Term Lease w/NY Archdiocese and new Parish of St. Vito’s/MHT
  - Proposal for School – FASNY H.S. (10th, 11th & 12th)
  - Projected # of Students – 140 (280 elementary students at MHT in 1960’s)
  - Convent/Rectory – to be used for FASNY Offices/Admissions
  - Gym – used by FASNY H.S.
  - Parking – 24 spaces on-site – potential of 50 spaces off-site within 500 feet

- **Current Split Zoning does not allow this proposed use except for Rectory use as offices**

- **Planning Board Special Permit allows and facilitates Proposal**
  - Preserves existing buildings and their architecture
  - Maintains Highly Visible and Historically Significant Group of Buildings along the Post Road
  - Bring Vacant Buildings back into Use
  - Modifies existing non-conforming dimensions
  - Provides for off-site parking to accommodate uses
WHERE ARE WE NOW?

▪ Planning Department presented legislative recommendations to the Board of Trustees on adaptive reuse of religious and education properties in the Village of Mamaroneck – November 2, 2015

▪ Planning Board made a positive recommendation to the Board on November 19, 2015

▪ Draft Legislation developed and sent to the Board of Trustees – March 2016

▪ Planning Board reviewed legislation and made a positive recommendation – March 2016

▪ Legislation referred to Westchester County Planning – March 2016

▪ Legislation referred to HCZM for advisory LWRP consistency determination for meeting on March 16, 2016

▪ Public Hearing scheduled on March 28, 2016

▪ Anticipated Approval in April/May 2016